



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A15040031

Page 1 of 1

The allegation contends that Figure 3 in the proposal¹ is presented as preliminary data, but was actually published in 2011.² However, Figure 3 is not described in the proposal as preliminary data, nor does the proposal assert that it is unpublished. The 2011 publication is included as a reference in the proposal, and is listed in the biographical sketches of both coPIs (who are authors) as a relevant publication. The allegation further contends that the same figure previously appeared in a poster by an author not named in the proposal. That poster, however, is authored by a collaborator with the two coPIs of the proposal. Finally, the allegation contends that some of the ideas in the proposal (without identifying which) are drawn from a graduate student dissertation. However, that graduate student³ is a collaborator with the coPIs, and is also included as an author on the 2011 publication.

This case is closed with no further action taken.

1

2

3